

A STUDY OF PAOAY, ESCOPA, AND ANDAM-MOUSWAG PUBLIC HOUSING PROJECTS

ARTEMIO D. PALONGPALONG

Preliminary Remarks

Before I discuss my paper I would like to mention certain points. First, this is not a complete presentation but only the preliminary findings on the study of the new public housing program especially after the declaration of martial law. Second, the paper focuses on housing from the specific perspective: housing has a process, starting from conceptualization, planning, implementation, and evaluation. As I have said earlier, the process is not yet complete in so far as the subject matter is concerned. Third, it also discusses the factors considered in the policy-making for housing program or the delivery of housing services from the government housing agency to the intended beneficiary. Fourth, I would like to acknowledge a good paper written by Professor Sicat on the evaluation of housing as an instrument of national policy.

I would like to give you a brief summary of my paper.

In the past, the number one question that came to mind when talking of housing is a particular housing area, or the question of design-size and features of the roof, the wall, or the floor. Housing was considered from the point of view of physical planning. Today, people, including national development planners, have realized that housing is not merely concerned with building a vertical-horizontal structure. It also has many other aspects — socio-economic, environmental and cultural components, and a lot more.

1. In our study it would appear that one of the main considerations is *socio-economic consideration*. In the case of the Andam-Mouswag project in Nabacan, Misamis Oriental it was an offshoot of the decision of the government to disperse industrialization and develop counterpoints or counterpoles of growth in the countryside. In 1974, the government decided to establish the PHVIDEC Indus-

Former Project Manager, Andam-Mouswag Project, Villanueva, Misamis Oriental, 1975-1977.

trial Estate in the towns of Villanueva and Jasaan, Misamis Oriental. It is thrice the size of Manila proper and even larger than the EPZA in Mariveles. By the year 2000 this estate will displace around 2,000 families and it shall have a full complement of light to heavy industries.

For the purpose of the study, we are merely concerned with 38 hectares presently occupied by the Philippine Sinter Corp. (PSC), a subsidiary of the Kawasaki Co. of Japan. The PSC displaced around 180 families in 1974-75 and the inter-agency task force was charged with relocating these families and providing them housing services.

In the case of Paoay, the project has something to do with the tourism program of the government which has envisioned Paoay Lake as one of the major tourist destinations in the north. Because of this, they saw the need for upgrading the sites and services surrounding the Paoay Lake. If we are to evaluate the value of this project from the economic standpoint it will largely be in terms of evaluating the increase of tourist traffic in the area and its resultant socio-economic development.

The barrio of Escopa in Quezon City is now the site of the upgrading of sites and services to solve the slum problem in the area.

2. *Environmental considerations.* The writings of Barbara Ward and Turner call for ecological balance — the balance of human beings on the one hand and industries and ecological disturbances on the other. One of the underlying concepts here is the concept of humanism. From these writings there is a concept whereby man himself is the main component in the delivery of housing services. The HHA developed the people-centered approach from this concept.

3. *Communities' aspirations and welfare.* People should be consulted on questions of design such as the size of the lot, cost of the housing unit, facilities, etc. However, consultations with people (or the people-centered approach) has its own limitations. It is possible that even with painstaking efforts of management to consult with the people, there are certain points which cannot be realized, or can never be decided upon during the planning stage; points which both the authorities and the affected population cannot see as a source of problem at the time the plan is being developed.

The approaches used in housing development are the following:

1. *Sites and services approach* — the main concern of the housing agency is the development of the site — the land, community services, and the necessary infrastructure facilities.
2. *Inter-agency approach* — recognizes the concept that

housing is not simply physical. It has multi-dimensional factors — health, education, etc.

Introduction

With the declaration of martial law in 1972, the style and structure of public decision-making had changed. The most concrete evidences of this change were the abolition of Congress, the assumption of legislative power by the President, the creation of the Barangay System, Sangguniang Bayan, Sangguniang Panlalawigan and the Regional Development Council. The Congressional power and prerogative to enact laws were assumed by the President, while some of its deliberate functions in various degrees and levels, were assumed by the barangays, town councils, provincial councils, and regional development councils in their respective legally-defined concerns and jurisdictions.

My study focuses on three case projects in the public housing program in the mid-seventies, with the hope of contributing some data and/or ideas concerning the patterns of public decision-making from 1974 up to 1978 just before the Interim Batasang Pambansa was inaugurated. Specifically, this brief study aims to highlight the policies on housing, with emphasis on the factors involved and the new style of making public policy concerning the housing program. It also attempts to bring into focus the significance of housing program in the scheme of national development goals.

However, this writer cannot possibly bring out all the significant details concerning the housing policies and policy considerations mainly because of time limitations. Even if that was possible, it would be unwise on my part to discuss lengthily a topic that is presumably not unknown to you — a group of scholars, technocrats, and experts.

My tasks, therefore, are only to outline the significant developments that have taken place in the public housing subsector, show how these developments impinged upon policy-making activity, and roughly determine how those policies affected the residents or communities living in the three case public housing projects of Andam-Mouswag in Misamis Oriental, Escopa in Quezon City, and Paoay in Ilocos Norte.

The Philippine Housing Situation, 1974-75

Like most other Third World countries, the Philippines has a serious housing problem. It is one of the unfortunate manifestations

of the heritage of colonialism. The conditions of underdevelopment that can be traced to four centuries of mass inactivity and demoralization, appears to have direct correlation with the inability of the masses to provide themselves decent food, clothing, and shelter.

The enormity of the housing problem is clearly discernible from the estimates of the defunct Philippine Homesite and Housing Corporation, to the effect that from 1970 to the year 2000 the yearly housing need in both rural and urban areas ranges from 304,000 to 467,000 units, or an average of 6.9 new units for every 1,000 population. If the housing backlog accumulated over the years is included, then the country needs 11,270,774 dwelling units in thirty years' time.

The estimates made by the National Economic and Development Authority (NEDA) are as follows: 7.2 to 8.3 new houses per 1,000 population per year for the period 1970-75 and from 5.3 to 7.2 new houses from 1975-80. NEDA assessed the discrepancies between the national program and actual performance. It found out that in 1974 and 1975, the plan called for the construction of 39,574 and 51,573 units, respectively. This plan called for the construction of 91,147 units which represented 1.04 units and 0.82 new houses per year per 1,000 population. This was quite behind its (NEDA's) estimated national need as cited above. What was actually realized was even below the figures contained in the plan; 26,744 newly-constructed dwelling units; 4,546 resettlement lots; and an insurance of 5,796 home mortgage. These figures represented only 34.3% of the programmed units. The actual disbursements was ₱614M out of the projected releases of ₱1,582M.

The Philippines' "housing gap" was noticed by the United Nations experts in the early seventies. The experts found out that while 5 to 6 percent of the Gross National Product invested annually in housing stock is an accepted norm, the Philippines has been putting in less than 3 percent in housing development.

Financially, the housing problem will stagger one's imagination. A ₱16,500.00 low-cost house of 1965 would cost ₱55,000.00 in 1975. This means that in 1975 alone, it would have already cost ₱20.6B to build the needed 375,000 units.

Case Project Selection

In selecting the housing projects where this preliminary study could be conducted, this writer considered four things:

1. The projects were planned and realized under the time-frame considered in this study; 1974-1978;

2. These are geographically dispersed in order to have a "representative project" from each of the three broad regions of the country;

3. The case projects shall more or less represent three categories: urban, suburban, and rural housing services; and

4. That the three types of housing projects, as defined by the National Housing Authority, will be represented: (a) resettlement (relocation), (b) construction of new dwelling units, and (c) on-site (*in situ*) development. In the latest vocabularies of the housing experts, this is called *sites* and *services* type. It is comprehended in the Zonal Improvement Program (ZIP) of Metro Manila and in the Slums Improvement Program (SIR) elsewhere in the country.

Of the many projects that were legally placed under the National Housing Authority pursuant to the provisions of P.D. 757 and P.D. 957, I have selected the Andam-Mouswag Project in Misamis Oriental; the Escopa Project in Quezon City; and the Paoay Project in Ilocos Norte. The selection of these projects to become the subject of investigation and inquiry was based on the four broad requirements mentioned above.

Andam-Mouswag Resettlement Project

The Andam-Mouswag Resettlement Project consists of one-hundred six (106) hectares of land (plateau) situated on the boundaries of the towns of Villanueva, Jasaan, and Claveria. It is in Bo. Kalingagan. It is approximately thirty-one kilometers northeast of Cagayan de Oro City and around six kilometers away from downtown Villanueva Misamis Oriental.

The present occupants of the different housing units are the original settlers of barrios Nabacaan and Katipunan, along the sea coasts of Villanueva, which have already become the site of the Philippine Sinter Corporation, a subsidiary company of Kawasaki (Japan). Incidentally, the PSC occupies 38 hectares of the envisioned 3,000-hectare Phividec Industrial Estate that resembles in purpose and function that of the Mariveles Export Processing Zone.

The original plan of the Inter-Agency Task Force (PEMO-DMS) on Nabacaan Relocation (Andam-Mouswag Project) was to make this project cover 500 hectares of land and become the home of 60,000 people in 25 years' time.

The Andam-Mouswag Project has complete community facilities. These are 134 housing units both of the one-storey and two-storey types, an elementary and high school buildings, a post office, a small

clinic, power and electrical installations, waterworks system costing about ₱1M (₱200,000 worth of pumps and pipes was donated by PSC), a basketball court, playgrounds, rock garden, an agricultural nursery, a social hall, sewerage system, road network, and for quite some time a government-owned transport system.

Socially and economically, the area has been full of projects and activities such as a tomato cooperative project financed by DBP with ₱45,000; a Sericulture Training Project; a Ham-making industry; a peanut-growing farm; a beautification drive spearheaded by the Youth Group; and many others.

The Project funding is regularly released by the National Government and has run to about ₱10M as of early 1977.

Escopa Urban Development Project

The Escopa Urban Development Project occupies 17.243 hectares of land in the barrio bearing that name. It is located in Project 4, Quezon City and is bounded by Marikina on the east; P. Burgos St. on the west; P. Tuazon St. on the south; and the Department of Social Services area on the north.

The barrio, formerly 17.243 hectares in land area, was utilized by the Japanese during their brief rule over Manila in the 1940's. The area was transferred subsequently to the Americans, then finally to the Philippine Government after the liberation.

Nine (9) hectares of the original total area have been placed under the supervision of the Social Welfare Administration (the forerunner of DSW) which utilized three (3) hectares for the Vocational Rehabilitation Center for the handicapped.

The first settlers of Escopa were construction workers for the Philippine Homesite and Housing Corporation in the 1950's. Today, the population has risen to 1,246 families of which 1,124 are bona-fide residents.

The area is divided into 4 barangay areas: Escopa I, II, III, and IV. The average household monthly income is ₱393.05.

The main apparent problems are: poor environmental conditions and substandard socio-economic living, as exemplified by the fact that 49% of the youth of school age are not in school.

In July, 1975, the Quezon City Government and the National Housing Authority entered into an agreement to undertake the Bo. Escopa redevelopment.

Paoay Project

The Paoay Project is a park development and sites and services improvement program rolled into one. It covers the barrios of Suba, Pasil, Nagbacalan, Sungadan and Nanguyudan in Paoay and Bo. Baay in Batac. Right now, the Project only affects directly Bo. Suba in Paoay.

Suba covers approximately 350 hectares along the northeast Shoreline of Paoay Lake. It is located a few kilometers northwest of Paoay town and around 14-15 kilometers south of Laoag City.

The original vertical structures of Suba were made of light materials. Community facilities and services were inadequate.

The total population of the barrio is 126 households or 603 persons. Most of the residents are farmers and fishermen, while some are seasonal construction workers.

Funding for the entire Paoay Lake Development Project is ₱7.8M.

Socio-Economic Factors

An analysis of various official documents, journals, articles, and the responses gathered through different interviews I conducted with 4 barangay leaders and NHA personnel formerly detailed in Paoay and Quezon City personnel detailed in Escopa and the area's barangay leaders including my own participation in the Andam Mouswag Project, point to social and economic factors as major inputs to housing policy-making activity. These socio-economic factors in turn, pre-determined to a large extent the thrusts of some projects.

However, the economic factors in the Escopa Urban Development Project come out on the same level as the other two projects wherein it was a major national concern. This is based on their geographic locations and the *rationale* put forward in the justification for undertaking such projects.

Andam-Mouswag is located in the suburban town of Villanueva (suburb of Cagayan de Oro City). It is part of the normally expected consequences of industrialization and industrial dispersal program of the Government, with the general expectation to develop what Barbara Ward and Rene Buboic call "counter growth poles." Indeed, in the minds of the top executive decision-makers of the country in 1974, the establishment of the 3,000 hectare Phividec Industrial Estate near Cagayan de Oro City, was

... envisioned to offer heavy industries not only a strategic access/link with the various industrial establishments locally and abroad, but also

the needed infrastructural support to operate heavy industries locally . . .

Subsequently, after the conduct of proper feasibility studies, the

Kawasaki is constructing an iron ore sintering plant including a pier wharf of 200,000 DWT capacity in some 100 hectares of land in Bo. Nabacaan which started last July 1974. The sinter plant which will complement the "self-sufficiency in steel and iron thrust of the government is expected to be fully operative by 1977. The project is also to produce and process an annual amount of 5,000,000 tons of iron ore during the first stages of operations (15,000,000 tons a year is the future target). The sinter product will all be exported to the Kawasaki Steel Corporation in Japan until the Philippine Steel Industry is fully integrated.

Thus, the fundamental decision to relocate the barrios of Nabacaan, Katipunan, and subsequently the adjacent areas was an offshoot of the national policy to establish this huge industrial zone near Cagayan de Oro City, the regional center for Region X (North-eastern Mindanao). Obviously, Cagayan de Oro City and its environs can serve as an alternative growth pole to Metro-Manila and other developed areas, given certain proper conditions and time.

Almost simultaneously, the Inter-Agency Task Force, charged with the task of relocation, site development, and administration of the newly-reformed community, began studying the socio-economic benefits that should be a rightful trade-off available to the affected communities. An inventory of human, technical, financial, organizational and agricultural resources was conducted, discussed, and used as raw materials for socio-economic planning. This was done side by side with physical-technical planning which was undertaken by an Engineer and two Architects of PHHC who were assisted by the 52nd Engineering Brigade, PA, the Bureau of Public Works, the NSDB, and a few other agencies. Significantly, one of the main reasons why Bo. Kalingagan was selected over other four or five alternative areas was due to socio-economic reasons: a vast and extremely productive agricultural plateau at its backyard with the town of Claveria as its center (it normally supplies Metro-Manila its tomatoes and other vegetable requirements, together with Benguet particularly during the rainy and flood season.

Together with social benefits like improved housing facilities, water, electricity, education, welfare activities, the average family income greatly increased. Forty-eight percent of the 189 initially affected families in 1974 (the highest group) had an average monthly income of ₱199-₱299, while 48.2% of the same group had an average family income of around ₱300-400 in February 1977.

The other side of the same coin, however, was an occasion for complaints: increased transport expenses by ₱1.50 daily; time spent for traveling; lot and housing amortization payment of ₱27.00 per month during the first two years (1975-77); and difficulty for twelve families (8% of the total relocated number) in doing their fishing activities. Moreover, a good number of the relocates has been nurturing poignant feelings over the "loss" of the properties located at Nabacaan or Katipunan, Villanueva.

On the other hand, the Paoay Project appears to be rationalized on the basis of (a) national park development and (b) upgrading of sites and services which, in short, is an input to socio-economic uplift for the affected community.

The latter consideration for policy-making initially anchored on the so-called "five-year socio-economic development program for Bo. Suba," assumes urgency in view of the following information:

1. The average monthly income of the families in Bo. Suba is ₱165.00
2. Eighty-five percent of the barangay residents have not gone beyond elementary schooling.
3. Most of the residents are on subsistence economic level, depending only on their meager agricultural produce and the resources of Lake Paoay.

What is more important, however, is that the Project is designed to cater to the national requirement for tourism, whereby Laoag City, Paoay Lake and their environs are considered a major destination. This has good bases. Laoag City (regional center for Region I) and the neighboring towns of San Nicolas, Batac, and Paoay look idyllic, what with its green scenery and old Spanish-type houses and churches. A comprehensive assessment based on the socio-economic benefits and trade-offs to displacement cannot be done at this stage. The Project has so far only tackled one of the six barrios, besides its being only one (1) year old. And to undertake such assessment is to do it largely in terms of the socio-economic effects of increased tourist traffic touching the area, which is a sufficient subject for another study.

Nonetheless, this much is quite clear at the moment: the plan to make Laoag City — Paoay Lake a major tourist destination uses the improved sites and services in the area, including Park development, as a means to realize said plan. And to the extent of that the increased tourist traffic stimulates production and exchange of goods and services thereby benefiting the entire region, the Bo.

Suba Project may be said to have been conceived as a mechanism for economic growth and development. After all, Laoag City, as the regional center of the Ilocos Provinces, is the logical choice for the development of a regional "growth pole" area.

The concept of regional "growth pole," which is applicable as a rationale for the development of Paoay and Andam-Mouswag Projects, however, cannot be applied to the Escopa Project, although the socio-economic considerations may be a top priority. Geographic location and lack of resources (non-human) are all weighted against the use of that concept as its *raison d'être*. In short, the social and economic considerations that became inputs into the decision-making process concerning the Escopa Project were probably on the lower level. The official National Housing Authority concept must be in order when it asserts that

It is the national government's desire to uplift the quality of life of the majority of urban squatters.

In brief, the economic factor in the development of Escopa is mainly for the purpose of improving the squatter families who reside in the area but not for regional, much less for national, considerations.

From the human and aesthetic points of view, the socio-economic uplift of Escopa is no less compelling. A look at the social and economic characteristics of the Escopans would bear this out.

1. The population density per hectare is 207, which is way above the acceptable 100-120 families per hectare.
2. The average family income per month is only ₱402.00, just about the same average monthly family income at Andam-Mouswag where the cost of living is much lower.
3. Forty-nine percent of the school-age populace are out of school, and 53.6% of the households get their water supplies from public faucets.

Environmental Factor

Side by side with socio-economic rationale for the establishment of many a housing project is the environmental factor. The ecological balance proposition that serves as the ringing theme for Ward's and Dubois' *magnum opus*, "Only One Earth," the theme of cultural development on Turner's "The City of Man"; the philosophical underpinnings of the New-Town Planning concepts in England; and even the *mosrav* and *Kibbutz* models of Israel — all these have one way or the other filtered into the planning vocabularies in the Philippine public housing areas.

Presidential Decree No. 953 represents the legal embodiment of the ecological balance idea. Issued sometime in 1976, the decree requires that 30% of any housing area shall be green areas and open spaces exclusive of subdivision roads and drainage. Although there is the usual gap between the policy and the actual implementation, one cannot escape the message this decree carries.

The Andam-Mouswag Project is, perhaps, the most controversial project in the entire Southern Philippines on various counts: (1) distance between the site and downtown. Villanueva is 6 kms. away from the town where most of the family heads are employed at the Industrial Estate. The transport fare is just too much; (2) "too modern" structures for low-income groups; (3) undefined political boundaries (it falls largely within Villanueva but some areas are actually part of Claveria and Jasaan municipalities). But there is one thing that it cannot be faulted: its compliance with the ecological balance requirements.

Of the 106-107 hectares of land bought by the IATF and NHA for the Project site, only around .39 hectares are presently developed as residential areas. Of the 39-hectare residential area, no less than six hectares are devoted to the school grounds, basketball court, rock garden, market area, agricultural nursery and loops usually found in the Radburn type of physical planning for housing areas. The other parts of the entire site are currently utilized for agricultural and light industrial activities (dairy-processing, ham-making, tomato production, etc.). Thus, the density is only 2.3 families per hectare in the present residential portion which is much less than the standard density limit.

The green belt in Paoay is an improvement on what characterizes Andam-Mouswag. While its density (the initially-developed Suba-area) is only a little more than the density at Andam-Mouswag, 2.7 families per hectare, its green areas are much larger and wider than that of Andam-Mouswag. In fact if this pattern of development is followed in the remaining five barrios surrounding the Lake, then the whole Project will indeed become ideal.

Of the three case projects, Escopa presents an opposite picture in terms of present state of ecological balance. The density alone – which is 207 households per hectare of land – is simply overpowering. With the plan to reblock the whole area plus the projected purchase of 4.45 hectares of land that is presently owned by the Philippine School of Business Administration, this density may be decreased and allow "breathing space."

It is probably due to the severe congestion and the attendant sickness and the relatively low level of health conditions among the residents which is a natural consequence of unbalanced environment that led to the decision by the Metropolitan Manila Commission, the NHA, the Quezon City Government, and the barangay leaders, to consider Escopa a top priority area for urban redevelopment.

Community Aspirations and Welfare

The community's desires, aspirations, and welfare are explicitly mentioned in the National Housing Authority statements of policy, goals and objectives. To attain such broad goals, the housing program has come up with the "people-centered" approach to housing development. How this particular approach has evolved and in what manner it was implemented in the three case projects may be briefly assessed.

Before going into the specific developments concerning community aspirations and welfare in the projects, a brief discussion on the concept of cross-subsidy scheme may serve as eye-opener for some possibilities of using reform measures in the housing program. Proposed sometime in 1976, the cross-subsidy scheme envisions the presence of three components in a project: social housing, economic housing, and commercial-industrial area.

The first component, involving the lowest socio-economic stratum, shall be charged 5% interest on expenses incurred. The second component, involving the middle class, shall be charged 12%. And the third, component, the rich, shall bear the burden of 18-20% interest charges. Assuming that the three components equally share the total funding for the project, the yearly average interest charged shall be between 12-13% which, roughly, is the cost of money in the financial market. In this scheme the upper levels of society subsidize the cost of providing housing service to the poor mass, and the NHA maintains its liquidity. Clearly, this appears as a viable approach to the staggering (P20.6B in 1975 alone). amount needed to take the housing program off the ground, based on the idea of self-liquidating project. The aspect that appears problematic is in the actual task of mobilizing human and material resources.

However, this scheme was not made operational. Consequently, other financing schemes were used, of which the one used at Andam-Mouswag and Escopa are typical examples.

The Andam-Mouswag approaches and scheme designed to fulfill the community welfare requirements, may be seen through the following developments:

Firstly, numerous assemblies were held in 1974 in the residents' original barrios of Nabacaan and Katipunan, to explain the program of industrialization in 1974 and the housing project in Misamis Oriental.

Secondly, alternative courses of action were presented, discussed and weighted according to merits: (1) relocation and housing service to be provided by the government which will cost them 6% of most expenses incurred over and above the principal costs; (2) choice of being resettled at the Department of Agrarian Reform agricultural resettlement area in Pangatucan, Bukidnon, some 100 kilometers away from their place of abode; (3) relocation on their own with the transport-handling expenses being paid for by the government. Incidentally, these choices were made known to them after they have been paid their lands, houses, and improvements.

Thirdly, four alternative housing sites were presented to the affected communities after 136 out of 187 families opted for government-sponsored relocation. Although the final tabulation of points to the four possible sites (Kalingagan, Katipunan, Looc in Villanueva, and Sta. Ana barrio in Tagoloan) was done by the IATF management, yet all angles were explored with the families. Kalingagan came out the overwhelming choice of the people, which was weighted somewhere between 40-50 points. The rest was based on economic, environmental, and technical considerations.

Fourthly, four (4) types of housing designs and costings were also presented. All 136 of those who opted for relocation selected either one of the three designs that eventually were constructed by the physical development team of the IATF.

After phase I (physical development) was completed, a breakdown of expenses incurred was made available and is, more or less, as follows:

- A. Physical development (land purchase, construction of houses, roads, and drainage, water works system installation, temporary bunkhouses, etc.) . . . 71.8% (P7,180,000.00)
- B. Socio-economic Projects — (tomato, dairy, sericulture, ham and loom weaving projects, school, library, basketball court, community transport facilities, etc.) . . . 7.0% or around P700,000.00)
- C. Administrative-operational expenses . . . 18.2% (P1,180,000.00)
- D. Savings . . . 3.0% (P300,000.00)

It may be noted that the present 106 hectares of land area of Andam-Mouswag is projected for 400-500 families. When they

(families) moved to the project many of the project components had to be rushed in time for the actual transfer of these families in May 1975. This caused high per capita expenditure. But the main thing is that the relatively low percentage expenditure for socio-economic component is due to the absence of the majority of the projected beneficiaries as of that period.

The Paoay Project funding could be broken down into barrio components – ₱2.3M for Suba, ₱3.5M for Nanguyudan, and ₱2.0M released through LOI 529 for general upgrading of residential areas for Suba. We have to wait for further developments hoping that the future breakdown of funding results in classifications like socio-economic, physical, administrative, etc.

Escopa Project is slightly much better than the Paoay Project insofar as the availability of figures and categories of expenses show:

A. Quezon City Government participation (mainly roads, drainage, water)	₱1,175,000.00
B. NHA:	
Loan to Q.C. government (land exprop.: ₱5,338,320.00)	9,651,479.00
Escopa Citizens Committee expenditures (which shall be repaid by the community)	313,159.00
C. DPH	338,800.00
D. DLGCD	423,446.00
E. DOL (NMYC, BES)	96,320.00
F. MERALCO	96,800.00
TOTAL	<u>₱12,169,446.00</u>

The breakdown of the total amount along program component lines is as follows:

Land expropriation	₱ 5,338,320.00
Physical Development Projects	5,259,306.00
Social Development Projects	1,127,200.00
Economic Development Projects	144,620.00
TOTAL	<u>₱12,169,446.00</u>

It may be noted that social and economic projects funding constitutes 10.4% (1,271,820.00) of the total. This is definitely of much higher percentage than that of the Andam-Mouswag Project.

As regards the physical presence of the residents of Paoay and Escopa during assemblies, the interviews I personally conducted among three (3) Barangay Council Chairmen and the Coop President in Paoay, and four (4) Barangay Council Chairmen of Escopa, pointed to a common trend: the communities have been consulted in all major issues affecting the projects. But concerning the finer points

of commitments and participation, this shall be a subject of further investigation.

To reiterate the points brought out in this section, there is a definite trend of consulting with the affected communities regarding their idea of what constitutes a good, livable housing area. And perhaps, due to high costs involved in the purchase and development of land, the social and economic development component can only have a small percentage of the total funding. Nonetheless, there is a discernible trend towards devoting human and financial resources for human and economic development within the public housing areas.

Sites and Services Approach

In situ or sites and services approach in providing solution to the housing problem in the Philippines and in the Third World is characterized by extensive improvement of community facilities and minimum destruction of existing vertical structures. Apart from following the rule of minimum dislocation of people, it appears less expensive as compared to other approaches. It is, in fact a compromise between construction of new dwelling units (which is very expensive) and allowing spontaneous settlements to proliferate.

The sites and services approach is a concession to the basic idea and merit behind spontaneous settlement which, to some scholars, represent a solution rather than a problem. Quoting Turner and Goetz, D.J. Dwyer concluded:

"successful urban planning and low-income housing policies in *transitional contexts* (underscoring supplied) depend upon the alignment of government action with the priorities and forces of popular settlement."

It was in recognition of the validity of *in situ* approach that caused the housing program administrators to start applying it.

The Tondo Foreshore project is basically anchored on on-site development idea. Paoay's main thrust is also on site approach, which was selected by the residents who were presented two alternative plans before the start of the project in Suba last year. So is Escopa's. The same holds true in the development of all twenty-six (26) ZIP projects all over Quezon City. There are many more projects in Metro-Manila and other urban centers in the country whose philosophical inspiration is undergirded by on-site development concept.

Of the three case projects being closely investigated and reported in this paper, Paoay project bears watching for certain special reasons. Unlike the other projects in Metro-Manila and other urban centers, it is considered basically a rural housing project. Also, the families who are affected are mostly landowners, while in the other projects in the cities most are squatters.

This brings us to a point: that since the Paoay (Suba) families are mostly landowners, what effect does on-site development have on those families in terms of their perception towards development projects sponsored by the government?

This question is raised since it will be interesting to see how the Paoay residents' view of development projects will compare with the rather negative view on the same subject exhibited by Andam-Mouswag residents who were "deprived" of their lands and other properties.

On the whole, it appears desirable to conduct an inquiry on the overall socio-economic gains on-site development can generate for the affected communities as well as for the project management. If this writer is allowed the luxury of speculation, the probable gains management shall have is reduced costs and number of personnel required for project operations.

Organizational Approaches

Two things characterize the organizational approaches to housing services planning and management: (1) inter-agency structure and (2) the detail of young personnel in the field.

The Inter-Agency approach, like the inter-disciplinary approach in the academe, is basically designed to solve problems and issues from various angles. The multi-dimensional character of problems found in the housing areas is the basis for the institution of this approach.

The Inter-Agency Task Force on Nabacaan Relocation (1974-1975) originally consisted of the following agencies: Philippine Veterans Investment and Development Corporation, Philippine Homesite and Housing Corporation, Presidential Assistance on Housing and Resettlement Agency, Bureau of Public Works, Bureau of Public Highways, National Housing Corporation, 52nd Engineering Brigade, PA, and the Department of Social Welfare. From the original eight (8) agencies in 1970, it increased to more than twenty (20) agencies in 1975. This number was more or less maintained during the NHA period (1975-present).

The participation of the local governments is a relevant point to discuss. While in early 1975 up to 1977 the DLGCD representative was active in cooperative and barangay formation at Andam-Mouswag, the municipal and provincial governments had only consultative functions during the same period.

This is in direct contrast to the cases of Paoay and Escopa. In the first project, the Governor of Ilocos Norte was included in the Paoay Lake Inter-Agency Committee created under LOI 539, issued on April 5, 1977. This Committee, aside from the Governor's Office, included the NHA, the Budget Commission, DPWTC, KPH, Local Water Utilities Administration, the NEA, DLGCD, the KB of Ilocos Norte, and the Department of Education and Culture, or a total of ten (10) agencies of the government.

The Escopa Project, which still awaits full implementation, has six (6) agencies engaged in planning in various aspects. Quezon City government is one of the lead agencies in point of manpower and financial participations.

At this juncture, two points need to be stressed and need further inquiry:

1. What contribution does the local government make in maximizing the acceptability of the Project?
2. Which is more efficient (cost-benefit analysis): inter-agency structure or single agency (Ministry of Ecology and Human Settlements) approach?

It is noteworthy that of the three case projects, it was only at Andam-Mouswag where so much criticism and complaints were lodged against its management, judging from the pamphleteering activities at Xavier University (Ateneo de C) campus; Japanese and Asian press releases (Asahi Shimbun, Far Eastern Economic Review); and denunciations made during sermons at the Villanueva Catholic Church. Coincidentally, it was at Andam-Mouswag where the local governments had less participation in the planning stage, although it had solid contributions during the actual transfer (relocation) of families in May 1975.

The other point that merits notice in this brief survey of organizational policy is the detail of young personnel in the housing areas. From 1974 to 1977, majority of the Andam Mouswag personnel belonged to the 10-31 age bracket. The same trend is discernible at Escopa and Paoay projects. At this stage, no study has been conducted precisely to assess what benefits the entire program gets from detailing young civil servants in the housing areas.

Future Topics

There are a number of topics that need careful study. These are the policy of "social mix" and the international agency participation. The first topic may yield some data and insights concerning the participation of various socio-economic strata in housing services delivery. As regards the latter, mention can be made on the participation of the United Nations Environmental Planning (UNEP) in the Escopa Urban Development Project and the USAID/Japanese Overseas Cooperation Agency in the development of the library and dairy processing projects at Andam-Mouswag. It may also provide us opportunities to test the beneficial or harmful effects of foreign agency participation in housing program planning and implementation.

What shall prove very exciting may be a study on Gaming Confrontation between the housing management and the affected community. Initial information and data gathered during interviews and actual fieldwork point to the following specific issues as worthy of further research:

A. Paoay:

1. The issue on the size of lots that shall be awarded to the affected families, which caused the residents to send a petition to the President;

B. Escopa:

1. The issue of "ineffective" barangay leadership prior to the creation of Bo. Escopa Citizens Committee.

C. Andam-Mouswag:

1. The issue regarding house and lot amortization payment. Threats and counter-threats were used subtly in various occasions.

A painstaking reconstruction of the events that took place during the aforementioned conflict-of-interest situations, may enlighten us on the dynamics of the forces (social, economic, political) operating in the public housing areas.

Based on this initial study the following tentative generalizations may be made:

1. Socio-economic, environmental-ecological and financial factors are considered in policy-making regarding the national housing program. As to the individual weights to these factors, this study cannot quantitatively show since this writer needs more time to formulate a scheme for that purpose. Perhaps, this writer can be guided

by Dr. Loretta Makasiar-Sicat's scheme that was used in her study, "Housing as Instrument of National Policy."

2. As to the approaches used in the implementation of the housing program, the following appear to be fast becoming popular: on-site and community welfare approaches.

COMMENTS

ROMUALDO TADENA

Philippine Center for Advanced Studies

I am not going to dispute the findings of Professor Palongpalong. In fact, I think he came out with a lot of data that many other people could use. What I would like to do is to help him come out with a revision.

1. What lessons could we possibly learn for purposes of planning at the regional and municipal levels? For example, I was hoping that Professor Palongpalong would show us how to delineate the interrelationships or linkages among or between the various components or forces which he discussed. It might be well for him to show how the corporate forces are meshed with the socio-political forces and how these linkages in themselves could be the basis of policy decisions.

2. I was also hoping that he would come out with a statement, no matter how difficult, on how these forces or linkages could hinder or accelerate the solution of our housing problem. And corollary to that, what is the economics of housing and how does it impinge on the cultural aspects of housing?

3. Perhaps he should also include a discussion on the role of the citizens in the solution of housing problem. It seems to me that if the government were to tackle the problem alone, we might be reinforcing what is now the trend of the people under the dependency institution. The housing program might make the people more dependent on the government and destroy the concept of self-reliance.

4. The question then, is: what is the proper mix between citizen participation and government support in approaching the housing problem?

5. Perhaps, by way of updating the data, it might be well to discuss the effects or implications of the creation of the Ministry of Human Settlements on the total philosophy of housing in the country. One of the principles being followed by the Ministry is "living space." Living space has two components: the physical, which is in terms of geographic area, and the psychological, in terms of the proximity of people to one another and how this proximity develops into certain norms of conduct which may not altogether be beneficial to society.